

1 Q. **B-25, Replace Emergency Diesel Generator, \$611,400**

2 Please provide a comparison of the advantages and disadvantages, other than
3 capital cost, from the experience of Hydro and from other utilities, of the purchase
4 of a containerized unit versus the purchase of a diesel genset and the construction
5 of a new building to house it.

6
7
8 A. This is Hydro's first project related to a hydro generation plant whereby a black
9 start diesel genset is being replaced with a larger unit requiring a larger room to
10 accommodate it. However, Hydro has had experience with replacing diesel gensets
11 with larger units in its rural operations diesel generating plants serving prime power
12 to isolated communities that are not connected to the provincial interconnected
13 power grid.

14
15 An advantage of a containerized system is that it offers a short site construction
16 period. It also allows the new diesel plant to be witness tested before it leaves the
17 manufacturing facility thereby providing opportunity to ensure it has no
18 deficiencies before it is delivered to the Bay d'Espoir site. In addition a
19 containerized unit also offers the flexibility of relocating the diesel plant to another
20 location, if desired in the future, at a much lower cost than the new building
21 alternative. An advantage of a new building alternative is that it allows greater
22 flexibility in a customized design for increasing floor spacing and ceiling clearances
23 inside the building. However Hydro is satisfied that a containerized plant can be
24 provided meeting requirements for proper floor spacing and ceiling clearances.

25
26 Hydro is a member of a hydro generation interest group, Hydraulic Plant Life
27 Interest Group, along with many utilities in Canada and the United States. Hydro

1 issued a request to this group regarding their experience in completing similar
2 projects whereby containerized plant and new building plant alternatives were
3 considered. A response was received from two utilities as follows;

4 1) Transalta:

5 " We found that the difference between the powerhouse infrastructure
6 to accommodate the generator indoors was more complicated than the
7 stand-alone building outside, therefore easier and less expensive to be
8 located outside."

9
10 2) Mighty River Power Limited:

11 " We have no particular preference for either solution, each has certain
12 advantages over the other."

13
14 A containerized diesel genset was initially considered for Bay d'Espoir due to the
15 availability of a suitable location. Due to the layout of the plant site, the closest
16 location near the powerhouse to place a new building was at the far end of the
17 powerhouse from the Station Service Panel. At that location, an existing storage
18 building would have to be relocated (more practically demolished and rebuilt
19 elsewhere). The smaller containerized unit can be located beside the cliff in the
20 foreground of the picture below. This is the closest possible location to station
21 service and the control room.

