

1 **Re: Page B-120, Diesel Plant Automation, \$516,200 (2008), \$379,200 (2009)**

2 Q. Please provide a detailed cost benefit analysis that has been undertaken in  
3 considering the possibility of automating each of these plants.

4

5

6 A. The results of a net present worth analysis of automating the Makkovik and  
7 Rigolet Diesel Plants are attached. Please note that the analysis is based on  
8 improvement of fuel efficiency of 0.2 kWh/litre. This is a very conservative  
9 figure as Hydro's experience with plant automation indicates that fuel  
10 efficiency improvements of 0.3 to 0.4 kWh/litre are typical. The analysis does  
11 not include other benefits which are more difficult to quantify. These include:

12 • Production of more energy between engine overhauls. With the diesel  
13 engine operating at higher average outputs, more kWh of electricity  
14 are produced between engine overhauls, thus the maintenance cost  
15 per kWh is reduced.

16 • With the diesel engine operating at higher average outputs, less air  
17 emissions per kWh are produced.

18 • With the diesel engine operating at higher average outputs, less  
19 lubricating oil per kWh is consumed.

20 • With the diesel engine operating at higher average outputs, engine  
21 fouling is reduced, reducing maintenance costs.

22 • The number and duration of outages to customers is reduced as the  
23 automated plant can respond to equipment failures more quickly than  
24 an operator can, especially outside normal working hours.

25 • Automation also provides data acquisition which can be used by  
26 operators, maintenance and engineering personnel for trouble  
27 diagnosis and optimizing maintenance planning.

**PROJECT COST / BENEFIT ANALYSIS TEMPLATE**

Makkovik Diesel Plant Automation

Status Quo

Status Quo

Note: Costs are shown as positive values; Benefits as negative values

Current Year	2007
Present Worth Year	2007
Number of Years in Study	26
Discount Rate	7.0%
Total In-service Project Cost	\$ -
In-service Year	2009
Other Project Cost after In-service (if applicable)	\$ -
Other Project Year (if applicable)	
Replacement Cost (if applicable)	\$ -
Replacement Year (if applicable)	
Project cost in Ending (E) or Beginning (B) Year \$\$	
O&M costs - 75% Materials, 25% Labour (75) or 50% Materials, 50% Labour (50) or User (U)	

A	B	C	D	E	F	G	H	I	J	K	L
Year		Annual O&M Cost \$	Annual Fuel Price \$/cdn/l	Annual Fuel Cost \$	Other Cost \$	Total Costs \$	Benefit 1 (specify) \$	Benefit 2 (specify) \$	NET \$	P.W. January 2007	Cumulative Present Worth
0	2007	-		-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
1	2008	-		-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
2	2009	-	0.68	741,050	-	741,050	-	-	741,050	604,918	604,918
3	2010	-	0.68	753,440	-	753,440	-	-	753,440	574,796	1,179,713
4	2011	-	0.70	798,150	-	798,150	-	-	798,150	569,070	1,748,784
5	2012	-	0.73	841,530	-	841,530	-	-	841,530	560,747	2,309,531
6	2013	-	0.75	893,077	-	893,077	-	-	893,077	556,163	2,865,694
7	2014	-	0.77	940,682	-	940,682	-	-	940,682	547,485	3,413,179
8	2015	-	0.79	987,492	-	987,492	-	-	987,492	537,130	3,950,309
9	2016	-	0.81	1,034,657	-	1,034,657	-	-	1,034,657	525,967	4,476,276
10	2017	-	0.84	1,084,729	-	1,084,729	-	-	1,084,729	515,347	4,991,623
11	2018	-	0.85	1,133,849	-	1,133,849	-	-	1,133,849	503,443	5,495,066
12	2019	-	0.88	1,187,308	-	1,187,308	-	-	1,187,308	492,690	5,987,756
13	2020	-	0.90	1,241,158	-	1,241,158	-	-	1,241,158	481,343	6,469,099
14	2021	-	0.91	1,293,932	-	1,293,932	-	-	1,293,932	468,980	6,938,079
15	2022	-	0.93	1,351,271	-	1,351,271	-	-	1,351,271	457,722	7,395,802
16	2023	-	0.95	1,409,253	-	1,409,253	-	-	1,409,253	446,133	7,841,935
17	2024	-	0.97	1,470,561	-	1,470,561	-	-	1,470,561	435,086	8,277,021
18	2025	-	0.99	1,533,785	-	1,533,785	-	-	1,533,785	424,104	8,701,125
19	2026	-	1.01	1,600,852	-	1,600,852	-	-	1,600,852	413,690	9,114,816
20	2027	-	1.04	1,671,605	-	1,671,605	-	-	1,671,605	403,714	9,518,530
21	2028	-	1.06	1,744,426	-	1,744,426	-	-	1,744,426	393,740	9,912,270
22	2029	-	1.08	1,820,232	-	1,820,232	-	-	1,820,232	383,972	10,296,242
23	2030	-	1.10	1,899,470	-	1,899,470	-	-	1,899,470	374,474	10,670,716
24	2031	-	1.12	1,981,925	-	1,981,925	-	-	1,981,925	365,168	11,035,884
25	2032	-	1.15	2,068,065	-	2,068,065	-	-	2,068,065	356,111	11,391,996
26	2033	-	1.17	2,158,032	-	2,158,032	-	-	2,158,032	347,293	11,739,288

Assumptions & Notes:

---

**Scratch Pad area for Annual Fuel costs**

This area is used to enter Fuel costs associated with the project. **NOTE: Fuel Prices are to be entered in Column D in Main Table**  
Economic Analysis section of System Planning prepares various fuel price forecasts for numerous delivery points.

Please reference the appropriate forecast and enter the values **in Column D in Main Table**.

Columns 3 below picks up the fuel prices from the main table. Columns 4 & 5 can be used to do some calculations if preferred.

Necessary calculations can be performed to determine each current year dollar value of the annual fuel costs.

The respective annual costs are to be entered in column 6.

**NOTE: Annual Fuel costs (if applicable) may start in the in-service year .**



1            2            3            4            5            6            7

Year	Annual Fuel price Scdn/l	Fuel Efficiency 3.25kwh/l Energy Forecast (MWh)	Annual Fuel costs (Current \$\$)	Comments / Explanations
0	2007	-		
1	2008	-		
2	2009	0.68	3.25 3547	741,050.15
3	2010	0.68	3.25 3601	753,440.00
4	2011	0.70	3.25 3711	798,150.46
5	2012	0.73	3.25 3762	841,530.46
6	2013	0.75	3.25 3870	893,076.92
7	2014	0.77	3.25 3955	940,681.54
8	2015	0.79	3.25 4042	987,491.69
9	2016	0.81	3.25 4131	1,034,656.62
10	2017	0.84	3.25 4222	1,084,729.23
11	2018	0.85	3.25 4315	1,133,849.23
12	2019	0.88	3.25 4410	1,187,307.69
13	2020	0.90	3.25 4507	1,241,158.46
14	2021	0.91	3.25 4606	1,293,931.69
15	2022	0.93	3.25 4707	1,351,271.08
16	2023	0.95	3.25 4811	1,409,252.92
17	2024	0.97	3.25 4917	1,470,561.23
18	2025	0.99	3.25 5025	1,533,784.62
19	2026	1.01	3.25 5136	1,600,851.69
20	2027	1.04	3.25 5249	1,671,604.62
21	2028	1.06	3.25 5365	1,744,425.62
22	2029	1.08	3.25 5483	1,820,231.89
23	2030	1.10	3.25 5604	1,899,469.58
24	2031	1.12	3.25 5727	1,981,924.65
25	2032	1.15	3.25 5853	2,068,065.18
26	2033	1.17	3.25 5982	2,158,031.85
27	2034	-		
28	2035	-		
29	2036	-		
30	2037	-		
31	2038	-		
32	2039	-		
33	2040	-		
34	2041	-		
35	2042	-		
36	2043	-		
37	2044	-		
38	2045	-		
39	2046	-		
40	2047	-		



**Scratch Pad area for Annual Fuel costs**

This area is used to enter Fuel costs associated with the project. **NOTE: Fuel Prices are to be entered in Column D in Main Table**  
Economic Analysis section of System Planning prepares various fuel price forecasts for numerous delivery points.

Please reference the appropriate forecast and enter the values **in Column D in Main Table**.

Columns 3 below picks up the fuel prices from the main table. Columns 4 & 5 can be used to do some calculations if preferred.

Necessary calculations can be performed to determine each current year dollar value of the annual fuel costs.

The respective annual costs are to be entered in column 6.

**NOTE: Annual Fuel costs (if applicable) may start in the in-service year .**



1            2            3            4            5            6            7

Year	Annual Fuel price (if applicable)	Fuel Efficiency 3.45kwh/l Energy Forecast (MWh)	Annual Fuel costs (Current \$)	Comments / Explanations	
0	2007	-			
1	2008	-			
2	2009	0.68	3.45	3547	698,090.72
3	2010	0.68	3.45	3601	709,762.32
4	2011	0.70	3.45	3711	751,880.87
5	2012	0.73	3.45	3762	792,746.09
6	2013	0.75	3.45	3870	841,304.35
7	2014	0.77	3.45	3955	886,149.28
8	2015	0.79	3.45	4042	930,245.80
9	2016	0.81	3.45	4131	974,676.52
10	2017	0.84	3.45	4222	1,021,846.38
11	2018	0.85	3.45	4315	1,068,118.84
12	2019	0.88	3.45	4410	1,118,478.26
13	2020	0.90	3.45	4507	1,169,207.25
14	2021	0.91	3.45	4606	1,218,921.16
15	2022	0.93	3.45	4707	1,272,936.52
16	2023	0.95	3.45	4811	1,327,557.10
17	2024	0.97	3.45	4917	1,385,311.30
18	2025	0.99	3.45	5025	1,444,869.57
19	2026	1.01	3.45	5136	1,508,048.70
20	2027	1.04	3.45	5249	1,574,700.00
21	2028	1.06	3.45	5365	1,643,299.50
22	2029	1.08	3.45	5483	1,714,711.20
23	2030	1.10	3.45	5604	1,789,355.40
24	2031	1.12	3.45	5727	1,867,030.47
25	2032	1.15	3.45	5853	1,948,177.35
26	2033	1.17	3.45	5982	2,032,928.55
27	2034	-			
28	2035	-			
29	2036	-			
30	2037	-			
31	2038	-			
32	2039	-			
33	2040	-			
34	2041	-			
35	2042	-			
36	2043	-			
37	2044	-			
38	2045	-			
39	2046	-			
40	2047	-			

**PROJECT COST / BENEFIT ANALYSIS TEMPLATE**

Rigolet Diesel Plant Automation  
Status Quo  
Status Quo

*Note: Costs are shown as positive values; Benefits as negative values*

Current Year	2007
Present Worth Year	2007
Number of Years in Study	26
Discount Rate	7.0%
Total In-service Project Cost	\$ -
In-service Year	2009
Other Project Cost after In-service (if applicable)	\$ -
Other Project Year (if applicable)	
Replacement Cost (if applicable)	\$ -
Replacement Year (if applicable)	
Project cost in Ending (E) or Beginning (B) Year \$	
O&M costs - 75% Materials, 25% Labour (75) or 50% Materials, 50% Labour (50) or User (U)	

A	B	C	D	E	F	G	H	I	J	K	L
Year		Annual O&M Cost \$	Annual Fuel Price \$cdn/l	Annual Fuel Cost \$	Other Cost \$	Total Costs \$	Benefit 1 (specify) \$	Benefit 2 (specify) \$	NET \$	P.W. January 2007	Cumulative Present Worth
0	2007	-		-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
1	2008	-		-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
2	2009	-	0.68	485,680	-	485,680	-	-	485,680	396,460	396,460
3	2010	-	0.68	497,022	-	497,022	-	-	497,022	379,176	775,635
4	2011	-	0.70	521,893	-	521,893	-	-	521,893	372,102	1,147,738
5	2012	-	0.72	554,473	-	554,473	-	-	554,473	369,468	1,517,206
6	2013	-	0.75	583,809	-	583,809	-	-	583,809	363,567	1,880,773
7	2014	-	0.77	613,780	-	613,780	-	-	613,780	357,226	2,237,999
8	2015	-	0.79	644,726	-	644,726	-	-	644,726	350,688	2,588,687
9	2016	-	0.81	674,169	-	674,169	-	-	674,169	342,713	2,931,400
10	2017	-	0.83	706,478	-	706,478	-	-	706,478	335,643	3,267,043
11	2018	-	0.85	738,062	-	738,062	-	-	738,062	327,708	3,594,751
12	2019	-	0.87	772,376	-	772,376	-	-	772,376	320,509	3,915,260
13	2020	-	0.89	805,929	-	805,929	-	-	805,929	312,553	4,227,813
14	2021	-	0.91	840,755	-	840,755	-	-	840,755	304,728	4,532,541
15	2022	-	0.93	876,318	-	876,318	-	-	876,318	296,839	4,829,380
16	2023	-	0.95	914,455	-	914,455	-	-	914,455	289,493	5,118,873
17	2024	-	0.97	952,421	-	952,421	-	-	952,421	281,787	5,400,660
18	2025	-	0.99	993,776	-	993,776	-	-	993,776	274,787	5,675,448
19	2026	-	1.01	1,035,604	-	1,035,604	-	-	1,035,604	267,620	5,943,067
20	2027	-	1.03	1,080,708	-	1,080,708	-	-	1,080,708	261,005	6,204,072
21	2028	-	1.05	1,126,700	-	1,126,700	-	-	1,126,700	254,311	6,458,383
22	2029	-	1.07	1,174,809	-	1,174,809	-	-	1,174,809	247,822	6,706,205
23	2030	-	1.10	1,225,115	-	1,225,115	-	-	1,225,115	241,527	6,947,733
24	2031	-	1.12	1,277,361	-	1,277,361	-	-	1,277,361	235,353	7,183,085
25	2032	-	1.14	1,331,964	-	1,331,964	-	-	1,331,964	229,358	7,412,444
26	2033	-	1.17	1,389,015	-	1,389,015	-	-	1,389,015	223,535	7,635,978

Assumptions & Notes:

Date Revised  
Date Printed 11-Sep-2007 4:13 PM

**Scratch Pad area for Annual Fuel costs**

This area is used to enter Fuel costs associated with the project. **NOTE: Fuel Prices are to be entered in Column D in Main Table**  
Economic Analysis section of System Planning prepares various fuel price forecasts for numerous delivery points.

Please reference the appropriate forecast and enter the values **in Column D in Main Table**.

Columns 3 below picks up the fuel prices from the main table. Columns 4 & 5 can be used to do some calculations if preferred.

Necessary calculations can be performed to determine each current year dollar value of the annual fuel costs.

The respective annual costs are to be entered in column 6.

**NOTE: Annual Fuel costs (if applicable) may start in the in-service year .**



1            2            3            4            5            6            7

Year	Annual Fuel price \$cdn/l	Fuel Efficiency 3.25kwh/l Energy Forecast (MWh)	Annual Fuel costs (Current \$\$)	Comments / Explanations	
0	2007	-			
1	2008	-			
2	2009	0.68	3.25	2335	485,680.00
3	2010	0.68	3.25	2386	497,022.15
4	2011	0.70	3.25	2437	521,892.92
5	2012	0.72	3.25	2489	554,472.62
6	2013	0.75	3.25	2540	583,809.23
7	2014	0.77	3.25	2594	613,780.31
8	2015	0.79	3.25	2649	644,725.85
9	2016	0.81	3.25	2705	674,169.23
10	2017	0.83	3.25	2763	706,477.85
11	2018	0.85	3.25	2822	738,061.54
12	2019	0.87	3.25	2882	772,376.00
13	2020	0.89	3.25	2943	805,929.23
14	2021	0.91	3.25	3006	840,755.08
15	2022	0.93	3.25	3069	876,317.54
16	2023	0.95	3.25	3135	914,455.38
17	2024	0.97	3.25	3201	952,420.62
18	2025	0.99	3.25	3269	993,776.00
19	2026	1.01	3.25	3339	1,035,603.69
20	2027	1.03	3.25	3410	1,080,707.69
21	2028	1.05	3.25	3482	1,126,700.20
22	2029	1.07	3.25	3556	1,174,808.55
23	2030	1.10	3.25	3632	1,225,115.20
24	2031	1.12	3.25	3709	1,277,361.04
25	2032	1.14	3.25	3788	1,331,964.18
26	2033	1.17	3.25	3869	1,389,015.35
27	2034	-			
28	2035	-			
29	2036	-			
30	2037	-			
31	2038	-			
32	2039	-			
33	2040	-			
34	2041	-			
35	2042	-			
36	2043	-			
37	2044	-			
38	2045	-			
39	2046	-			
40	2047	-			

**PROJECT COST / BENEFIT ANALYSIS TEMPLATE**  
 Rigolet Diesel Plant Automation  
 Plant Automation  
 Automation

*Note: Costs are shown as positive values;Benefits as negative values*

Current Year	2007
Present Worth Year	2007
Number of Years in Study	26
Discount Rate	7.0%
Total In-service Project Cost	\$ 347,600
In-service Year	2009
Other Project Cost after In-service (if applicable)	\$ -
Other Project Year (if applicable)	
Replacement Cost (if applicable)	\$ -
Replacement Year (if applicable)	
Project cost in Ending (E) or Beginning (B) Year	\$
O&M costs - 75% Materials, 25% Labour (75) or 50% Materials, 50% Labour (50) or User (U)	

A	B	C	D	E	F	G	H	I	J	K	L
Year		Annual O&M Cost \$	Annual Fuel Price (if applicable)	Annual Fuel Cost \$	Other Cost \$	Total Costs \$	Benefit 1 (specify) \$	Benefit 2 (specify) \$	NET \$	P.W. January 2007	Cumulative Present Worth
0	2007	-		-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
1	2008	-		-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
2	2009	-	0.68	457,525	-	805,125	-	-	805,125	677,084	677,084
3	2010	-	0.68	468,209	-	468,209	-	-	468,209	357,195	1,034,278
4	2011	-	0.70	491,638	-	491,638	-	-	491,638	350,531	1,384,809
5	2012	-	0.72	522,329	-	522,329	-	-	522,329	348,050	1,732,859
6	2013	-	0.75	549,965	-	549,965	-	-	549,965	342,491	2,075,350
7	2014	-	0.77	578,199	-	578,199	-	-	578,199	336,517	2,411,867
8	2015	-	0.79	607,350	-	607,350	-	-	607,350	330,358	2,742,225
9	2016	-	0.81	635,087	-	635,087	-	-	635,087	322,846	3,065,071
10	2017	-	0.83	665,523	-	665,523	-	-	665,523	316,185	3,381,256
11	2018	-	0.85	695,275	-	695,275	-	-	695,275	308,711	3,689,967
12	2019	-	0.87	727,601	-	727,601	-	-	727,601	301,928	3,991,895
13	2020	-	0.89	759,209	-	759,209	-	-	759,209	294,434	4,286,330
14	2021	-	0.91	792,016	-	792,016	-	-	792,016	287,063	4,573,392
15	2022	-	0.93	825,517	-	825,517	-	-	825,517	279,631	4,853,023
16	2023	-	0.95	861,443	-	861,443	-	-	861,443	272,711	5,125,734
17	2024	-	0.97	897,208	-	897,208	-	-	897,208	265,451	5,391,186
18	2025	-	0.99	936,166	-	936,166	-	-	936,166	258,858	5,650,043
19	2026	-	1.01	975,569	-	975,569	-	-	975,569	252,105	5,902,149
20	2027	-	1.03	1,018,058	-	1,018,058	-	-	1,018,058	245,874	6,148,023
21	2028	-	1.05	1,061,384	-	1,061,384	-	-	1,061,384	239,568	6,387,592
22	2029	-	1.07	1,106,704	-	1,106,704	-	-	1,106,704	233,456	6,621,047
23	2030	-	1.10	1,154,094	-	1,154,094	-	-	1,154,094	227,526	6,848,573
24	2031	-	1.12	1,203,311	-	1,203,311	-	-	1,203,311	221,709	7,070,282
25	2032	-	1.14	1,254,749	-	1,254,749	-	-	1,254,749	216,062	7,286,344
26	2033	-	1.17	1,308,493	-	1,308,493	-	-	1,308,493	210,576	7,496,920
		-									
		-									
		-									
		-									
		-									
		-									
		-									
		-									
		-									
		-									
		-									
		-									
		-									
		-									
		-									
		-									
		-									
		-									
		-									
		-									

Assumptions & Notes:



**Scratch Pad area for Annual Fuel costs**

This area is used to enter Fuel costs associated with the project. **NOTE: Fuel Prices are to be entered in Column D in Main Table**  
Economic Analysis section of System Planning prepares various fuel price forecasts for numerous delivery points.

Please reference the appropriate forecast and enter the values **in Column D in Main Table**.

Columns 3 below picks up the fuel prices from the main table. Columns 4 & 5 can be used to do some calculations if preferred.

Necessary calculations can be performed to determine each current year dollar value of the annual fuel costs.

The respective annual costs are to be entered in column 6.

**NOTE: Annual Fuel costs (if applicable) may start in the in-service year .**



1            2            3            4            5            6            7

Year	Annual Fuel price (if applicable)	Fuel Efficiency 3.45kwh/l Energy Forecast (MWh)	Annual Fuel costs (Current \$\$)	Comments / Explanations		
0	2007	-				
1	2008	-				
2	2009	0.68	3.45	2335	457,524.64	
3	2010	0.68	3.45	2386	468,209.28	
4	2011	0.70	3.45	2437	491,638.26	
5	2012	0.72	3.45	2489	522,329.28	
6	2013	0.75	3.45	2540	549,965.22	
7	2014	0.77	3.45	2594	578,198.84	
8	2015	0.79	3.45	2649	607,350.43	
9	2016	0.81	3.45	2705	635,086.96	
10	2017	0.83	3.45	2763	665,522.61	
11	2018	0.85	3.45	2822	695,275.36	
12	2019	0.87	3.45	2882	727,600.58	
13	2020	0.89	3.45	2943	759,208.70	
14	2021	0.91	3.45	3006	792,015.65	
15	2022	0.93	3.45	3069	825,516.52	
16	2023	0.95	3.45	3135	861,443.48	
17	2024	0.97	3.45	3201	897,207.83	
18	2025	0.99	3.45	3269	936,165.80	
19	2026	1.01	3.45	3339	975,568.70	
20	2027	1.03	3.45	3410	1,018,057.97	
21	2028	1.05	3.45	3482	1,061,384.25	
22	2029	1.07	3.45	3556	1,106,703.71	
23	2030	1.10	3.45	3632	1,154,094.03	
24	2031	1.12	3.45	3709	1,203,311.12	
25	2032	1.14	3.45	3788	1,254,748.86	
26	2033	1.17	3.45	3869	1,308,492.72	
27	2034	-				
28	2035	-				
29	2036	-				
30	2037	-				
31	2038	-				
32	2039	-				
33	2040	-				
34	2041	-				
35	2042	-				
36	2043	-				
37	2044	-				
38	2045	-				
39	2046	-				
40	2047	-				