- Q. Page 52: Dr. Booth states that "the big advantage of the CAPM is that it is
 difficult to make big mistakes". What does Dr. Booth consider is the range of "mistakes"
- 3 that wouldn't be "big"?

4

5 A. This sentence should be read in conjunction with the qualifications at the top of 6 the page:

7

8

9

10

11

"I have traditionally viewed my DCF estimates as "checks" on my CAPM estimates, since in my view CAPM estimates have usually been in the right "ball-park." However, the recent very low long Canada bond yields have forced me to re-evaluate this and look at what drives the difference between the DCF and simple CAPM estimates. This is because they should be consistent."

1213

- 14 With that qualification a normal market risk premium of 5-6.0% means that the
- difference between a low risk utility with a beta of 0.5 and a high risk company, like a
- tech company, with a beta of 1.5 is 5-6%.
- 17 In contrast, Dr. Booth has seen decades of very good MBA students implementing the
- constant growth DCF model, when long Canada bond yields were 5%, and saying things
- 19 like:
- The firm has a dividend yield of 3% and management indicates limited growth prospects of 1% so we take the equity cost to be 4%;
- The firm does not pay a dividend, but is expected to earn 20-25% over the medium term so we take the equity cost to be 22.5%.

24

- 25 In both cases the firm does not fit the requirements to use the constant growth DCF
- 26 model and instead some form of finite or multi-stage growth model is needed. The use of
- 27 the long Canada bond yield immediately questions the first estimate while the diagnostic
- 28 check that the growth rate goes on for infinity rules out the second. As a result, that

2016/2017 NP General Rate Application

Page 2 of 2

spread of 18.5% is directly the result of the inappropriate use of the constant growth DCF model.

3

- 4 The fact that we start with the long bond yield and an estimate of the overall market
- 5 return means that the mistakes made by the CAPM are rarely as bad as the above
- 6 mistakes using the DCF model. Dr. Booth had many animated discussions with his late
- 7 colleague, Professor Myron Gordon, who created the constant growth DCF model over
- 8 exactly these issues.